Inflation Targeting: Previously Unexplored Experience and Implications in Advanced and Developing Economies

Deysan Igor*
Postgraduate in Banking University, Kyiv, Ukraine

Abstract

Inflation targeting (IT) influences advanced and developing economies differently. Conducting graphical and econometric analysis the IT effectiveness in these two groups of countries was studied. Also the supposition about third-party factors that caused global disinflation was made. The article provides some explanation why some factors (institutional, economic and financial) distinguishing advanced and developing economies, reduce the effectiveness of the IT regime or even worsen some macroeconomic indicators due to IT implementation.

Highlights

• Slowdown of global inflation had begun before the IT was introduced by pioneer countries.
• Advanced economies achieved positive results from IT in terms of inflation. Developing economies mostly were not prepared – there were no impact on inflation.
• Employment was harmed (!) in both country groups and particularly in developing economies.

Keywords: Inflation targeting; Panel data regression; Advanced economies; Developing economies
JEL classification: E580; E310; F630; F620

Introduction

IT regime was pioneered in New Zealand in 1989 and further implemented in many countries. At present time it is the most effective system of monetary policy framework for the majority of the advanced economies. The movement to IT was dictated not only by attractive features of this regime. The impetus was also given by success in pioneered countries [1] and financial crisis caused by the fixed exchange rates policy.

Before the movement to IT the transformation of monetary policy passed several stages analyzed below [2].

Starting from 80th a great amount of central banks applied money supply targeting, which implies the stable link between the level of money supply and the inflation rate. However, theoretical assumptions as of the link between these variables did not find empirical confirmation. Thus, even theoretical money demand models lost their points with the development and deepening of financial markets. After that central banks have begun to change their monetary policy towards exchange rate targeting or eclectic approach with several objectives. However, countries that were trying to target exchange rate, conducted expansionary fiscal policy to a great extent [3]. At the same time, they were under the influence of external shocks. As a result, domestic and external imbalances were accumulated and countries began to abandon the exchange rate pegs in favor of more flexible exchange rates.

Many economies preferred IT, because such regime was able to resolve a set of problematic issues, aroused during implementation of previous regimes. In particular, unlike monetary targeting, IT did not require a stable link between money supply and inflation. However, IT implied a stable monetary anchor as a low inflation for all market participants. Unlike exchange rate targeting it did not suffer direct influence of external conditions, and vice versa it absorbed external shocks. IT can be easily understood by the public [4] and it is one of the advantages of this regime. Permanent communication policy increases the central bank credibility and reduces uncertainty. Since the objective has always been predetermined and approved by legislative mandate, as the duty of the central bank, the Bank is always accountable to the public on its achievements.

First central banks, which have implemented IT, determined only price stability as the strategic goal of their monetary policy. They also identified interest rate as the main tool which ensures the achievement of price stability in the long-run period. The convenience of this mechanism and the maintaining of the discipline among market agents were highlighted. An important argument was that price stability has been prerequisite for aiming on other macroeconomic objectives that had to be achieved by economies as a whole.

Banking systems and financial markets have been developing a lot. And it was evident that ensuring price stability as the only duty of the central bank could not ensure macroeconomic stability and could not protect IT countries from financial crises [5]. The vivid example is Iceland where the central bank had implemented IT and for many years had been conducting monetary policy successfully. The inflation rate was low, about 2-4 percent, but the lack of attention to issues of financial stability, inadequate banking regulation and prudential supervision of the country had led to severe financial and political crisis. Later some economists tended to believe that IT as a monetary regime has been overcoming crisis. Famous Sweden scientist Lars Svensson gave the comment [6] on this topic, identifying IT as a flexible framework, which is being developing and transforming...

*Corresponding author: Deysan Igor, Postgraduate in Banking University, 1, Andriyivska St., Kyiv, Ukraine 04070, Tel: +380987778797, E-mail: deysan@yandex.ru
Received February 08, 2017; Accepted March 01, 2017; Published March 03, 2017
Copyright: © 2017 Deysan I. This is an open-access article distributed under the terms of the Creative Commons Attribution License, which permits unrestricted use, distribution, and reproduction in any medium, provided the original author and source are credited.
together with the development of the economy and financial markets. Initial traditional approach, when the central bank used the inflation as one objective only, was changed into flexible IT framework which takes into account the economic cycle and focus on financial stability issues. After the crisis, inflation-targeting central banks determined second basic function for their policy. It was financial stability [7].

Nowadays monetary policy makers are increasingly focused on state institutions quality. Monetary policy results, the effectiveness of financial market regulation and prevention of the bubbles on housing and security markets highly depend on effectiveness and quality of state institutions. The article considers the gap in this area being one of the most important barrier to successful IT. In general, the study reveals how successful was IT as the monetary policy regime, what are the costs of transition to this regime for different groups of countries and what are the main challenges, according to the author, of inflation targeting implementation.

The low rates of inflation are evidently the most convenient for the economic development. High inflation rates lead to the uncertainty increase and therefore negatively affect economic growth [8]. In contrast low inflation environment allows easy business planning and also making long-term investment decisions more attractive and effective. Under conditions of low inflation saving behavior of households is formed. Therefore, financial intermediation function is more active. These are indisputable arguments in support of low inflation. However, price stability is only the final result. This result is achieved repeatedly and is consistently supported by sending necessary impulses through monetary transmission mechanism. And if price stability is a positive achievement, the process of its achieving may come into conflict with other goals of macroeconomic policy, such as support for economic growth, low unemployment and financial stability.

Focusing only on the inflation objective is considered as neglecting other indicators the central bank should also focus on [9]. As it was mentioned above one of the arguments for IT support is money neutrality theory [10]. This means that money supply change in the long-run period can affect nominal indicators only, while GDP and unemployment tend to equilibrium in this period. Despite the fact that economic and monetary views are largely based on this theory, today there are more and more contrary studies [11,12].

Maintenance of low inflation rate, except communications and verbal interventions, requires to change interest rate (the main monetary tool). It means the increase of interest rate to such a level that slows economic growth. Namely the objective is achieved by reducing aggregate demand. But in this case a problem indicated by the economists occurs [13,14]. Inflation has different nature. First of all, it is demand inflation, which is caused by excess demand in the economy. Also inflation can be determined by supply fluctuations. In particular, the occurrence of negative supply shock, such as an output decline, may speed-up inflation. The last one forces the central bank to use measures to curb inflation, but this only deepens the decline in output.

Also, inflation may have imported [15] or administrative nature. In any case the central bank will have the only existing, inadequate to the source of inflation, reaction – restriction of aggregate demand.

As there is a stable link between aggregate demand and employment, also many researchers [16] suffers from tight monetary policy aimed on inflation reduction.

As a result inflation we can suppose influence on employment, caused by lower flexibility of real wages. In particular, the crisis phase of the business cycles can lead to inability of enterprises to pay wages. A low inflation rate according to economists [17] causes the «grease effect» that helps to avoid implications of the prices and wages rigidities. In the case of inflation, the reduction of real wages will occur automatically, allowing the employers not to reduce nominal wages or to fire workers. Some studies emphasize the low «dose» of inflation, which may vary for different groups of countries, but usually is in a range of 2-6% [18]. However, some scientists [19] noticed that inflation below 10% (or somewhat higher) is very likely to be consistent with higher rates of economic growth for middle- and low-income countries.

Also there are important clarifications and relative negotiations as of IT influence on macroeconomic indicators. In particular, according to the Phillips curve there is a long-term inverse relationship between the rate of inflation and the unemployment rate. However, later it was added that unemployment and GDP return to its previous level in the long-run, while inflation is irreversible. According to scientists’ view, under IT regime, employment and economic activity will decrease only while inflation target is being achieved. Then these indicators will return to the previous level. This is neoliberal view that the economy always tends to equilibrium. So, the only macroeconomic variable that economists should think about is inflation. However, this neoliberal trend is quite disputable. Today there are many research papers which could doubt Keynesian theory described above. However, solutions and guidance for central banks in developing economies are based on neoliberal theory.

In this paper we study the possible impact of IT both on inflation and the real macroeconomic indicators such as GDP and unemployment rate. Our empirical research should confirm or deny such links for to make further relevant conclusions.

**Graphical Analysis and First Assumptions: Is a Low Inflation Rate the Result of IT or Just the Coincidence?**

A graphical analysis of long inflation and GDP history brought us to a few conclusions. Global inflation rate declined from high levels at the beginning of the study period to a low level at its end. Meanwhile, acceleration of the global GDP growth was mainly due to the contribution from the double digits growth rate of the Chinese economy during the decades. This may indicate some structural changes that have occurred in the world economy, carrying disinflation influence without slowing economic growth (Graphs 1 and 2).
From the diagrams we can conclude that inflation slowdown occurred before the movement to IT. During first implementation of IT in the advanced economies (New Zealand and Canada - in 1989, the UK - in 1992, Finland and Australia - in 1993) the average inflation rate in the whole group of countries has been about 3%. Active use of IT caused unsustainable trend to further inflation slowdown. If we observe developing economies, the inflation rate declined to 4% level even before the first introduction of IT (Graphs 3 and 4).

We can assume that IT policy kept inflation on the low level. However, it is evident that overall inflation in the world declined due to other factors. Also, perhaps, these factors explained continued low inflation.

The rapid development of globalization is among such factors. Reduction of tariff and customs barriers among countries, intensification of trade and competition, as a result, caused significant disinflation in the global economy.

Also, the supply shock was a significant factor of inflation decline. On the one hand it was caused by the reduction of costs owing to technological innovations. At the end of the last century there was a steady increase in productivity [20], which pushed some prices down. On the other hand, a shock was caused by the entrance of China and other low-cost producing countries into the global commodity market. This gave the impetus to competition and formed the supply of cheap

**Graph 2:** Global GDP, % annual change. Source: IMF; author’s estimates.

**Graph 3:** Inflation in advanced economies and IT spread-over. Source: IMF; central banks web-sites; author’s estimates.

**Graph 4:** Inflation in developing economies and IT spread-over. Source: IMF; central banks web-sites; author’s estimates.

**Graph 5:** Average index KOF of economic globalization by groups of countries. Source: KOF Swiss Economic Institute; author’s estimates.

Low Inflation Is the Result of Inflation Targeting or Coincidence? Implications for the Real Economy

Econometric Analysis and Conclusions: Whether Low Inflation Is the Result of Inflation Targeting or Coincidence? Implications for the Real Economy

Now we will analyze panel data on inflation, GDP and unemployment rates in different countries. We will use annual data for the period from 1985 to 2015. For inflation, we will take the average annual CPI change. For GDP, annual changes will be used. Regarding unemployment level, we will take unemployed as the share of economically active population. All the data was obtained from IMF web-site (Global Economic Outlook database).

For inflation, we will take the average annual CPI change. For GDP, annual changes will be used. Regarding unemployment level, we will take unemployed as the share of economically active population. All the data was obtained from IMF web-site (Global Economic Outlook database).

Analysis is done with the help of linear regression with panel-adjusted standard errors (PSCE) as the following:

\[ \text{MacroVariable}_i = \text{Dummy_IT} \times \text{Dummy_Country}_i \times \text{Dummy_Year}_i, \]

where

- \( \text{MacroVariable}_i \) - macroeconomic variable (GDP, inflation or unemployment);
- \( \text{Dummy_IT} \) - dummy variable that takes the value one in the year of IT adaptation and keep it further;
- \( \text{Dummy_Country}_i \) - a set of dummy variables that takes the value one for each country;
- \( \text{Dummy_Year}_i \) - a set of dummy variables that takes the value one for each year.

The composition of the model in such a way allows taking into account significant difference in inflation across countries due to economic and political features. In addition, we take into account typical processes for certain years (including dummies for years). It was found that standard errors are heteroscedastic, correlated within and intra group. Taking into account the features of the data (T<N) PSCE estimator was chosen as the best for this case. Additionally, for advanced economies FGLS (fit panel-data linear models by using feasible generalized least squares) was estimated, taking into account these features. In particular, we assume that some studies [22] could find positive IT effect missing this valuable point.

Panel regression were built both for the whole list of countries and separately for developed and developing economies. 1985 was taken as a base year.

It was found that standard errors are heteroscedastic, correlated within and intra group. Taking into account the features of the data (T<N) PSCE estimator was chosen as the best for this case. Additionally, for advanced economies FGLS (fit panel-data linear models by using feasible generalized least squares) was estimated, taking into account the T (time periods) is close to N (the quantity of groups) for this case. Additionally, for advanced economies FGLS (fit panel-data linear models by using feasible generalized least squares) was estimated, taking into account the T (time periods) is close to N (the quantity of groups) for this case. Additionally, for advanced economies FGLS (fit panel-data linear models by using feasible generalized least squares) was estimated, taking into account the T (time periods) is close to N (the quantity of groups) for this case. Additionally, for advanced economies FGLS (fit panel-data linear models by using feasible generalized least squares) was estimated, taking into account the T (time periods) is close to N (the quantity of groups) for this case. Additionally, for advanced economies FGLS (fit panel-data linear models by using feasible generalized least squares) was estimated, taking into account the T (time periods) is close to N (the quantity of groups) for this case.

Main results are represented in the Table 1.

**Additional information concerning the model choice**

The papers of Reed [23] and Hoechle [24] provided the main background for decision to choose PSCE and FGLS models. First of all some approaches proposed by Reed R. & Haichun Ye were used to test standard errors of the model. For to get heteroscedastic (by assumption) standard errors “xtgls” estimation of the model was used.
with "panels(heteroskedastic)" option. After that "HETCOEF" was estimated as the measure of the degree of groupwise heteroscedasticity present in a given data set. We can see that the errors of all the series are quite heteroscedastic.

**Group-specific SDs of errors were sorted in ascending order**

Errors of the model for inflation were represented in Graphs 8-10.

Errors of the model for GDP were represented in Graphs 11-13.

Errors of the model for Unemployment were represented in Graphs 14-16.

Although some doubts are concerning inflation model errors, we still assume heteroscedasticity here due to two reasons: according to analysis of number of separate cases standard errors looked like heteroscedastic on the graph; estimation of the inflation model with simple linear regression approach (xtreg) provided the same conclusions with regard to the sign and significance of IT coefficients.

The "RHOHAT" (estimates the value of the common AR(1) parameter using observations from a given data set) was higher than 0.95 for almost all country groups indicating high level of autocorrelation.
Having analyzed the whole list of countries we can trace a trend of inflation decline, founded at the end of 90s. There is also unstable upward trend in negative value of coefficients. As the effect of IT was considered separately, it is possible to draw conclusions about other general factors that determined worldwide inflation reduction. This is fully complied with our previous assumptions based on graphical analysis.

As regards IT, its coefficient was insignificant, and therefore such a

Also significant cross sectional correlation among standard errors was found.

The number of sections only for advanced economies were close to time periods number (26 in all cases), while in other cases it exceeded the number of periods significantly.

All these arguments pushed us to choose PSCE for model estimation with "pairwise correlation(psar1)" option. Taking into account low quantity of sections for advanced economies the FGLS was also estimated for these cases.

**IT Influence on inflation**

Having analyzed the whole list of countries we can trace a trend of inflation decline, founded at the end of 90s. There is also unstable upward trend in negative value of coefficients. As the effect of IT was considered separately, it is possible to draw conclusions about other general factors that determined worldwide inflation reduction. This is fully complied with our previous assumptions based on graphical analysis.

As regards IT, its coefficient was insignificant, and therefore such a
IT Influence on GDP

As of IT influence on economic activity, it was not found for entire sample. However, IT positively contributed to GDP growth particularly for advanced economies. So the conclusions of IT regime defendants about the positive influence on economic activity was approved, but in the great extent for advanced economies. While emerging economies did not experience any GDP impetus. These results are entirely consistent with the results for inflation and could mean that lower inflation has a positive impact on economic activity.

IT Influence on unemployment

The final step was to analyze the influence of IT on employment as one of the most important indicators of welfare. In the model we used reverse indicator, namely unemployment. According to the model unemployment in average has been declining for several years before the crisis of 2008, but after the crisis it has increased slightly (coefficients that compare unemployment with the base 1985 year remained negative, but their absolute values became lower). However, the greatest value for us represented the impact of IT regime on unemployment. The implementation of this regime caused unemployment increase (the rate for Dummy IT was statistically significant and positive). Analysis by individual groups of countries demonstrated that this result was ensured by both country groups. Meanwhile, developing economies experienced higher impact of IT regime on unemployment.

So, as results of our model, we can conclude that implementation of IT regime accelerated disinflation processes in advanced economies, which in turn contributed to their economic growth. However, the opposite situation occurred in developing economies. IT regime was not effective in the sense of impact on inflation. This may be due to many features of developing economies. In particular, the consumption structure in these countries (Graph 7) is in a big portion represented by components, prices of which are not affected by monetary policy. They are determined by supply factors or in administrative manner. The implementation of IT in these countries was fulfilled mainly in the conditions of weak state institutions, and missing structural reforms, particularly in the energy and other monopolistic sectors. Meanwhile, regression results showed that the implementation of IT was accompanied by an increase in unemployment! (Graph 16).

Notation

GDP growth and employment reduction, which is the result for advanced economies, is contrary to Okun’s law. While some scientists [25] queried the validity of this law in certain countries, we will not make the emphasize on the last result for advanced economies. Additional motivation (besides Okun’s law) for not to underscore this problem for advanced economies is the results obtained by simple panel regression estimation (xtreg) without heteroscedasticity robust standard errors1. In terms of IT influence they coincided with PSCE and FGLS for all cases besides unemployment in advanced economies (the influence was not significant). Although our benchmark models (PSCE and FGLS) point on unemployment increase after IT launching in both country groups, we will pay more attention only for the result for developing economies.

Additional thought as of IT

Some scientists are cautious of further expansion of IT. This regime continues spreading among the developing economies despite the little

1These estimates were made by the author additionally and are not disclosed in these papers.
evidence of IT success in promoting economic growth, job creation and poverty reduction, as well as mixed conclusions on the effectiveness of IT in lowering inflation. As a result, in the last two decades, central banks shifted their policies from development objectives to stabilization purposes [16]. In particular, central banks focus on financial and price stability. The justification for such action is theoretical absence of long-term relationship between monetary policy and real economic variables. However, today there is the necessity of seeking new bases for monetary policy, in particular the balanced approach. Taking into consideration undeveloped financial markets and poor transmission mechanism, monetary policy under IT in developing economies may be only partially effective through anchoring of inflation expectations in case central bank is able to build the credibility of society. GDP growth and employment will be tasks mainly for fiscal policy and structural reforms.

Despite affecting the employment, IT may aggravate some other challenges and risks for the economy:

Inflation targeting regime leads to redistribution of influence on macroeconomic policy between the spheres of society [26]. It is a quite rare critique of inflation targeting, but it has a clear explanation. Neoliberal approach is based on the maximum slimming down governmental influence on the economy. Given that the central bank clearly identifies a single target (inflation) and focuses responsibility on its achieving, it dissociates itself from the problems and issues the government facing with. Therefore, the government loses all the influence on the central bank. Also the government loses capacity to achieve social goals. And the society is in the following situation: it has to soften their demands to the government and also the demands to the central bank should be limited only by inflation. Given that the central bank now has more independence, then the financial elite, including banks, financial elite have more lobbying influence.

It mostly removes the responsibility from central banks for other important macroeconomic and monetary purposes if banks do not chose flexible approach in implementing inflationary targeting. In particular, significant narrowing of credit activity will not be the reason to rebuke central banks in the case of successful implementation of inflation targets.

Inflation targeting leads to unequal wealth distribution being implemented in the period of positive supply shock, in particular caused by productivity increase.

Scientists [27] stated the following effect: productivity growth leads to lower unit costs of companies. In such cases, the company reduces the price of the product, keeping the profit margin and at the same time expanding its market share. This leads to positive change in owners’ income, and to increase of the workers’ real incomes, given the decline in prices. However, the policy of inflation targeting, obliges central bankers to inflation stimulation. So what happens? Prices remain the same, because the central banks stimulus move them up to the previous level. Owners profits grow significantly and real earnings of workers are relatively unchanged or increase slightly due to only partial redirection of additional owners’ income to the payroll.

Inflation targeting creates the risks of bubbles on asset markets [28]. Asset prices growth may occur regardless of consumer prices dynamics (particularly in the case of the mortgage boom in the US in 2002-2006 or the corresponding boom in Japan in 1995-1999). Therefore, the dilemma exists of how the central bank should operate in the case of divergence between consumer inflation and asset inflation. In particular, what should be the central bank interest rate decision when projected consumer inflation is within targets, but asset prices are rising rapidly? Among consequences may be consumer deflation, and, respectively, the loss of public confidence. As the worst-case financial instability may be provoked.

We believe that the central bank should follow an adaptive policy in above-mentioned situations. Where the economy is below its potential level, the indicators of aggregate output and employment should be in priority. In addition, the attention should be paid to inflation, but only when it is caused by demand factors. That is, in the case of certain overheating the central bank can shift attention towards price stability achieving inflation target in the long-run using the flexible IT.

High economic growth does not necessarily lead to high levels of employment. Scientists make such conclusions later. Employment is no longer a derivative of economic growth. In 2006, the United Nations Organization determined the necessity to accomplish policy making by such purposes as productive employment and decent work.

So, the problem of unemployment becomes more important. We believe that governments and central banks should jointly deal with this problem by making their policy as of employment not only as a derivative of other fiscal or monetary measures, but as a separate policy direction.

Conclusions

Oliver Blanchard, former chief economist of the IMF, said about the illusion of only one monetary objective and only one monetary tool for its achievement, meaning low inflation and short-term interest rate respectively. He explained that after the crisis it became clear the necessity of many purposes and mechanisms to achieve social goals.

A key caution for emerging economies is the following: government should prepare economy in a proper way before movement to the IT. On the one hand, it is necessary to establish effective monetary policy. On the other hand, it is important to form appropriate consumption structure of the population with prices of goods and services largely exposed to political influence. It is also important to pay attention to strengthening measures aimed at financial stability, banking regulation (supervision), structural reforms and the creation of a favorable business environment. Otherwise IT introduction may cause unemployment, financial instability and undermined confidence instead of keeping low inflation.

The obtained results give grounds to state that IT regime can be effective. However, institutional and economic preparedness of countries is highly important. Advanced economies had these qualities. This enabled them to achieve basically positive results from IT in terms of inflation. In the same time unemployment increase after IT adoption raises concerns.

Developing economies mostly were not prepared to effective implementation of such regime and therefore they have suffered adverse effect. In particular, employment was harmed significantly, while there was no impact on inflation.

Acknowledgements

I would like to express appreciation to my scientific adviser Dr. Oleksandr Petryk, who helped me to grow as a research scientist and gave me important piece of advice concerning this study. I would like also to thank Prof. Tom Coupé for providing a detailed understanding of the panel data analysis. My special thanks to Iulia Diachenko for language assistance provision.
References

OMICS International: Open Access Publication Benefits & Features
Unique features:
• Increased global visibility of articles through worldwide distribution and indexing
• Showcasing recent research output in a timely and updated manner
• Special issues on the current trends of scientific research
Special features:
• 700+ Open Access Journals
• 50,000+ editorial team
• Rapid review process
• Quality and quick editorial, review and publication processing
• Indexing at major indexing services
• Sharing Options Social Networking Enabled
• Authors, Reviewers and Editors rewarded with online Scientific Credits
• Better discount for your subsequent articles
Submit your manuscript at: https://www.omicsonline.org/submission/